Undervalued, Underpaid, and Under Siege
Solutions to End Wage Inequity
Beverly Neufeld
Founder and President
PowHer New York

Undervalued, Underpaid, and Under Siege Solutions to End Wage Inequity
New York’s Equal Pay Movement

• Since 2007, the Equal Pay Campaign, a non-partisan project of PowHer New York, has educated, advocated and engaged the public and our leaders to end wage and opportunity discrimination.

• Focused on concrete actions to address wage disparity, achieved legislative successes, policy shifts in government and business, public dialogue, and action!

• For 14 years New York has commemorated Equal Pay Day, but this year is different.
Underpaid, Undervalued and Under Siege
Solutions to End Wage Inequality

MARCH 30, 2020 AT 1PM EST
Underpaid, Undervalued and Under Siege
Webinar Panelists will address:
+ Causes of wage inequity and new research;
+ Effects of COVID-19 on women’s economic security;
+ Obstacles that particular groups of women face;
+ Legislative Successes in New York
+ Next steps in the fight to end wage and opportunity inequity

New York Equal Pay Day Virtual Rally

MARCH 31, 2020 AT 1PM EST
New York Equal Pay Day Virtual Rally

+ On Twitter and Facebook using #EqualPayNY
+ Videos and quotes will call for action and THANK COVID-19 workers
**Equal Pay Day** is the symbolic day in 2020 a typical U.S. woman works to make as much as the typical male earned in 2019.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All Women*</td>
<td>88¢</td>
<td>82¢</td>
<td>March 31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian American**</td>
<td>85¢</td>
<td>90¢</td>
<td>February 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black**</td>
<td>65¢</td>
<td>62¢</td>
<td>August 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native American**</td>
<td>58¢</td>
<td>58¢</td>
<td>October 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latina**</td>
<td>56¢</td>
<td>54¢</td>
<td>October 29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mothers***</td>
<td></td>
<td>70¢</td>
<td>June 4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* All women vs. All men  **Group vs. White non-Hispanic men  ***All U.S. moms compared to all U.S. dads
Panelists:

+ **C. Nicole Mason**, Institute for Women’s Policy Research - Overview and New Research
+ **Jaclyn Dean**, NAPAWF - Focus on Asian American Pacific Islander Women
+ **Janice Brown**, AAUW NYS - Focus on African American Women
+ **Elisa Charters**, Latina Surge - Focus on Latinas
+ **Donna Seymour**, North Country Matters - Focus on Rural Women
+ **Sarah Brafman**, A Better Balance - NYS Legislative Wins
+ **Seher Khawajar**, Legal Momentum - New Legislation
ASK A QUESTION!

+ Use the Chat Box at the bottom of your Zoom meeting screen to ask a question!

+ **Not on your computer?** Email info@powherny.org.
C. Nicole Mason

President and CEO
Institute for Women’s Policy Research
The Wage Gap for Asian American and Pacific Islander women

Jaclyn Dean
she/her/hers
Policy Manager
National Asian Pacific American Women’s Forum (NAPAWF)
Asian American and Pacific Islander women: not the model minority

• AAPI women make up 2.9% of the overall workforce, but 4.4% of the low-wage workforce

• AAPI women are overrepresented in many low wage industries including personal care, service, and retail
For every dollar the average white, non-Hispanic man makes, these Asian American/Pacific Islander women make...

Malaysian
Taiwanese
Indian
Chinese
Japanese
Sri Lankan
Korean
Pashtun
Filipino
Indonesian
Tongan
Vietnamese
Thai
Guamanian/Chamorro
Hawaiian
Samoa
Hmong
Bangladeshi
Cambodian
Filipino
Burmese
Nepalese

$1.25
$1.23
$1.20
$1.00
$0.92
$0.90
$0.90
$0.88
$0.83
$0.79
$0.75
$0.67
$0.67
$0.67
$0.66
$0.63
$0.62
$0.61
$0.60
$0.57
$0.55
$0.52
$0.50

While AAPI women on average make 90 cents to the white male dollar, disaggregated data tells a different story...
AAPI women in some states experience more drastic wage gaps

New York:
AAPI women make **83 cents** to the white male dollar
Unions help AAPI women get equal pay
Janice Brown
President
American Association of University Women New York State (AAUW NYS)
African American Women and Equal Pay

JANICE BROWN, PRESIDENT
AAUW-NYS
● **Intersectionality**: Black women experience both a race and gender wage gap.

● **Wage Gap**: The sharpest earnings differences are between Black women and white men, but Black women also experience wage disparities when compared with white women and black men.

● Regardless of their occupation, level of education, or years of experience, Black women are still paid less than men.

● African American Equal Pay Day: Black women work an additional 8 months compared to twelve months to match the salary of white men of the previous year.
Economic Security

- Women of color make up 35 percent of the female workforce in America.
- Between 1997 and 2013, the number of women-owned businesses increased by 59% the number of Black women-owned businesses increased by 258%.
- If paid equally to the average American woman, the average black woman would earn almost $950,000 more over the course of her career.
- To be effective, equal pay measures must focus on pursuing new strategies and reforms that acknowledge and tackle these problems head-on.
Education

- Education is the catalyst of change and self-improvement.
- A high-quality education is a prerequisite for success. While Black women are attaining degrees at a higher rate than any other class, they also have the highest student loan debt.
- For an undergraduate degree, they carry about $30,400 in debt, compared with $19,500 for white men.
Job Market

- Most women of color are more likely to stagnate in their careers than white women and face greater barriers to advancing in the workplace.
- **Lower-wage jobs:** Black women make 79 cents for every dollar made by white men - average annual salary of the 40 lowest-paying jobs is $23,600 for black women compared with $30,000 for white men.
- **High-salary positions:** The disparity is worse: Black women typically are paid 67 cents for every dollar paid to white men in the same occupation. That translates into $70,000 versus $105,000, and a difference over 40 years of $1.4 million.
We invite you to join us as we continue to fight for the rights of women and girls with equal pay, paid sick leave, affordable healthcare, educational opportunities, advocacy, and research.

- AAUW is helping women to overcome these pay inequalities is by learning to negotiate your salary. For additional information on negotiating your salary, check out salary.aauw.org to learn to learn these skills online.
2020 Equal Pay Day – POWHER Webinar

Closing the Pay Gap for Latina/x Professionals and Small Business Owners

Presented by
Elisa Charters – President, Latina Surge National & Lean In Latina Surge Network
Awareness about **Equal Pay** is key. Talk about it with everyone!

- 2020 data reflects an almost 50% differential in pay for Latina/x professionals
- Status quo in D&I corporate performance supports momentum towards self-employment
- Latina/x small business owners now at risk due to Coronavirus – loans/bailout
- Collective responsibility to know and share corporate D&I data on supplier diversity – empowerment via purchasing power

[LatinaSurge.org](https://LatinaSurge.org)
Minority-Owned Fueling Growth in Women Entrepreneurship

- Minority women growing much faster than the average 45% growth rate

2006 and 2016 Women-owned businesses (million)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2016</th>
<th>Growth Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Latinas</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>137%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African-American</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>112%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

COVID-19

**Positive Impacts**

**Innovation**

**Communications**

**Negative Impacts**

Who gets to be the new project lead?

Who gets business grant/loan access?

Who gets Student Loans Assistance?

Internships cancelled?

Who gets laid off?
It’s 2020... time to close the gap on Equal Pay... $$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$

Estela Rizzuto, StellarVision LLC & VP Latina Surge National
Donna Seymour

Host
North Country Matters

Undervalued, Underpaid, and Under Siege: Solutions to End Wage Inequity
Percent of Households Below the ALICE Threshold by County, New York, 2010 and 2016

Sources: American Community Survey, 2010 and 2016, and the ALICE Threshold, 2010 and 2016. Details on each county’s household income and ALICE demographics, as well as further breakdown by municipality, are listed in the ALICE County Pages and Data File at UnitedWayALICE.org

ALICE Report: https://www.unitedforalice.org/new-york
New York

Three rural definitions based on Census Urban Areas

Rural locations are those outside Census Urban Areas with a population:

- Greater than or equal to 2,500
- Greater than or equal to 10,000
- Greater than or equal to 50,000

Urban locations under all three definitions:

For more information on definitions, see documentation.
Number of Jobs by Hourly Wage, New York, 2016

Percent Employment by Firm Size, New York, 2016

Fewer Than 20 Employees

500 or More Employees

Source: U.S. Census, Quarterly Workforce Indicators, 2016
I SAID, "WE'VE BEEN DOING SOCIAL DISTANCING BEFORE IT WAS POPULAR."
EQUAL PAY DAY WEBINAR

Undervalued, Underpaid, and Under Siege
Solutions to End Wage Inequity
Sarah Brafman
Senior Policy Counsel
A Better Balance
A BETTER BALANCE

National legal non-profit organization

Headquarters in New York City

Proud leader in the fight for equal pay in New York and fighting to build a fabric of protections that support all women and working families, especially those who are most vulnerable to unfair workplace policies.
Pay Discrimination

In New York State, it is now illegal to pay employees with status within one or more protected classes less than an employee without status within the same protected class or classes for equal work or “substantially similar work” based on a composite of skill, effort, and responsibility, and performed under similar working conditions.

- For instance, an employer can’t pay a Project Manager and a Project Team Lead or a janitor and a housekeeper differently if they perform “substantially similar work.”
Pay Discrimination – Example

Employee A is a Black woman. Employee B is a white woman. Both work at Company Y. They have different titles, but both of them have jobs that involve data analysis, building and implementing models, and running simulations. Can Company Y pay them differently?

Answer: Probably not! The New York law makes it illegal for employers to pay employees differently based on “substantially similar work,” with a few exceptions. Whether work is substantially similar is not based on job title—it’s based on a composite of skill, effort, and responsibility, and the similarity of working conditions.
Salary History

Can my employer, or potential employer, ask me questions about my salary history?

A new statewide law passed in 2019 which applies to ALL public and private employees makes it illegal for employers to rely on or ask for your salary history in deciding whether to offer you a job, or in determining your compensation for a new job.

NYC prohibits pay discrimination and has a salary history ban as well.
RESOURCES

Check out our:
- NY Working Woman’s Pocket Guide for detailed information about NY equal pay laws at: www.abetterbalance.org
THANK YOU!

www.abetterbalance.org
@ABetterBalance
Call our free, confidential legal hotline at 1-833-NEED-ABB
Seher Khawaja
Senior Attorney, Economic Empowerment
Legal Momentum

Undervalued, Underpaid, and Under Siege Solutions to End Wage Inequity
Contributing Factors to Pay Inequity:

- Overt discrimination and implicit bias
- Lack of transparency surrounding compensation
- Unequal distribution of caregiving responsibilities
- Occupational segregation
- Depressed wages
Compensation/Compensation Range Disclosure Bill for New York State & Localities:

- **Mandatory disclosure of compensation for any employment opportunity**: Requires all private employers in New York State to disclose in writing or electronically the compensation or compensation range, benefits, and other forms of compensation, when issuing a new employment opportunity.

- **Disclosure to current employees**: Requires employers to provide that same information to existing employees regarding their current position and that information must be provided to the employee at time of hire and upon an employee’s reasonable request.

- **No retaliation**: Prohibits employers from refusing to interview, hire, promote, or otherwise penalize anyone who asserts their rights under this provision.

- **DOL enforcement**: The NYS Department of Labor to provide a complaint mechanism, investigate violations, impose civil penalties, promulgate regulations if necessary, and engage in outreach.

- **Defines “range of compensation”**: as the range that the employer actually relied on in setting compensation, including any applicable pay scale or compensation model that the employer relied upon or the actual range of compensation for those currently holding the position.
Purpose and Rationale for Compensation Disclosure Laws

- **Eliminating overt discrimination and implicit bias in salary setting:** employers inject overt or implicit biases into the hiring process, including salary setting and may factor in an applicant's gender, race, or other characteristic when setting compensation amount. Proving this type of discrimination, however, is challenging and prevents accountability.
  ⇒ A key purpose of a compensation disclosure bill is to eliminate the opportunity for employers to use gender bias, racial bias, and other forms of bias to shape their salary decisions.

- **Enhancing transparency to level the playing field for women:** women applying for new positions who are in the dark about salary are likely to ask for less and due to long-term discrimination will have less leverage in negotiating salary. Research shows that women are more willing to negotiate and more successful at negotiating when job applicants are informed about compensation, benefits, or conditions.
  ⇒ Providing information about salary up front, creates transparency that is likely to put women and people of color in a better position to negotiate and advocate for themselves.
How to Move from a Bill to Law

- Engage in outreach with legislators in your county and New York State
- Share information with your network
- Raise visibility through social media and communications platforms
- Educate your peers about the importance of pay transparency
- Join PowHerNY’s Equal Pay Campaign – email info@powherny.org
Q + A

+ Use the Chat Box at the bottom of your Zoom meeting screen to ask a question!

+ Not on your computer? Email info@powherny.org.
Together, we can take actions to address systemic inequity and close the wage and opportunity gap. After the webinar, you will receive an email with ways to be involved, including:

+ Learn more from our Panelists about Equal Pay
+ Speak out online - March 31st - Equal Pay Day from 1-3PM
+ Help Pass NY Salary Range Disclosure Law and Federal Paycheck Fairness Act
+ Join the PowHerNY Equal Pay Campaign
+ Vote your issues! PowHer the Vote!
+ Support our Equal Pay Campaign!
New York Equal Pay Day Virtual Rally

Tuesday, March 31st from 1-2PM EST
Twitter and Facebook Using #EqualPayNY
Solutions to End Wage Inequality
and Under Siege
Undervalued, Underpaid,